Dear ████████

I understand the situation, but I still fundamentally disagree with the model, which was not clear to me when I submitted a proposal for the Special Issue (the information I was given suggested that as Guest Editor I would be able to select the papers to be published free of charge based on their individual merit, not on reputations of authors).

I am disappointed that MDPI will not consider an alternate model for at least this Special Issue, which is focused on our failures: a major one of these being our failure to engage with local experts in low-middle income countries!

Please remove me as Guest Editor from this issue. Also note that we will have to explain to our 'failures' colleagues the reasons that we are no longer taking part in the Special Issue.

Thanks,
Dani

Dr Dani Barrington, FHEA
Lecturer

-----Original Message-----
From: ████████ MDPI <████████mdpi.com>
Sent: Thursday, 23 April 2020 12:23 PM
To: Dani Barrington <D.J.Barrington@leeds.ac.uk>
Cc: IJERPH Editorial Office <ijerph@mdpi.com>; Dani Barrington <dani.barrington@uwa.edu.au>
Subject: Re: [IJERPH] Special Issue "Learning from Failure: in Environmental and Public Health Research" Website Is Ready

Dear Dr. Barrington,

Sorry for the late reply.

We can really understand you may have concerns about providing discount/waiver for the top scholars who from developed countries. The aim of feature paper for SI is attracting more contribution from top scholars who from developed countries to increase the visibility of journal. Currently, we can only provide free opportunities for these top scholars from developed countries. But to encourage scholars from some developing countries who did the excellent academic works, we also have plans to provide discount to them (but cannot waive the fees), such as the authors from, South Africa, Romania, Russia, Latvia.

As you know, IJERPH is an open access journal, we have no charges for rejected articles, no submission charges, and no surcharges based on the length of an article, figures or supplementary data. Open access also means that we also have no subscription charges, and we solely rely on collecting the publication fees to support our low-cost open access project. We did free layout and English editing service for authors, but these are not free for us. We provide many waived fees chance to the authors from different research fields, this is a huge charge and burden for us. We will consider expanding feature paper author coverage in the future (In fact we are already doing this). If we can get fund support, this process may be faster. Anyway, hope you can understand and support us in this difficult time. Thank you.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions or suggestions.

We are looking forward to hearing from you.

Kind regards,

██████

Section Managing Editor
IJERPH (http://www.mdpi.com/journal/ijerph/)
████████████████████████████ ██████████████

On 2020/4/15 10:41, Dani Barrington wrote:
> Dear ████████
>
> Unfortunately, I cannot ethically contribute as a Guest Editor to this
> issue under these conditions. I do not believe that priority for
> waiving fees should be given based on prestige, but on the quality of
> the papers and their contribution to the discipline, with a focus on
> those voices that are often left out of the discussion precisely
> because they are based at organisations that cannot afford the fees
> associated with publication. I strongly believe that one of the major
> failures of our field (environmental/public health research) has been
> a lack of local insight into what 'works' and does not work in
> low/middle income countries, for the simple reason that local authors
> are often marginalised and their experiences are not widely shared.
> For this reason, I strongly advocate for the fee waiver for this
> special issue to be targeted at authors in low and middle income
> countries, with acceptance of that work obviously based on the quality
> of the paper and its relevance to the topic (i.e. accepted after standard peer review).
> Established academics from high income countries are the most likely
> to be able to cover journal publication fees and do not merit this
> kind of support. I believe this special issue is sufficiently
> different in terms of the content we are asking for, that established
> authors will still take the opportunity to submit something without funding support.
>
> If MDPI are willing to allow me to recommend these fee waivers based
> on quality and relevance of papers, then I will continue as Guest
> Editor for this issue.
>
> If, however, the waivers will be based on pre-approval of 'prestigious'
> authors by the Editorial Board, then I withdraw my application for the
> Special Issue and my services as Guest Editor.
>
> Sincerely,
>
> Dr Dani Barrington
>
>
> --------------------------------
> *Dr Dani Barrington*
> Visiting Lecturer in Water, Sanitation and Health
>
> School of Civil Engineering
> University of Leeds, Leeds LS2 9JT
> Email: d.j.barrington@leeds.ac.uk ████████████████████
> Room: 4.08 Civil Engineering
> Phone: +44 (0) 113 34 36260 <tel:%2B44%20%280%29%20113%20343%201751>
> Twitter: @dani_barrington @wateratleeds @leedsunieng
> Skype: dani.barrington
> In: http://www.linkedin.com/in/danibarrington
> Lecturer, School of Population and Global Health, The University of
> Western Australia Honorary Fellow, School of Public Health, The
> University of Queensland <http://www.uq.edu.au/>
>

> --
> *From:* ███████ ████ MDPI <████████ mdpi.com>
> *Sent:* 15 March 2020 10:38
> *To:* Dani Barrington <D.J.Barrington@leeds.ac.uk>
> *Cc:* IJERPH Editorial Office <ijerph@mdpi.com>
> *Subject:* Re: [IJERPH] Special Issue "Learning from Failure: in
> Environmental and Public Health Research" Website Is Ready Dear Dani,
>
> You can make a list for potential authors who you want to give
> discount and send the list to me. I will apply for approval for these authors.
>
> Kind regards,
> ██████
>
> Section Managing Editor
> IJERPH (http://www.mdpi.com/journal/ijerph/)
> ████████████████████████████████ ████████████████████
> Guest Editor Recruitment, if you are interested, please send your
> proposal to ████████ mdpi.com.
> https://www.mdpi.com/journalproposal/sendproposalsspecialissue/ijerph
>
> On 2020/3/13 18:06, Dani Barrington wrote:
>> Hi ███████
>>
>> So is it up to me to decide who to offer the discounts to? Or do I have to present arguments to IJERPH for
their approval of individual authors/papers?
>>
>>
>>
>> Dr Dani Barrington, FHEA
>> Lecturer in Water, Sanitation and Health
>>
>> Deputy Lead; Water, Public Health and Environmental Engineering
>> Research Group Programme Lead; Master of Science in Water, Sanitation
>> and Health Engineering
>>
>>
>> -----Original Message-----
>> From: ███████ ████ MDPI [mailto ████████ mdpi.com]
>> Sent: 09 March 2020 02:06
>> To: Dani Barrington <D.J.Barrington@leeds.ac.uk>
>> Cc: IJERPH Editorial Office <ijerph@mdpi.com>
>> Subject: Re: [IJERPH] Special Issue "Learning from Failure: in
>> Environmental and Public Health Research" Website Is Ready
>>
>> Dear Dani,
>>
>> Thank you very much for your e-mail.
>>
>> the aim of the free paper quota is to attract more high quality papers from the top scholars to increase
visibility to the special issue.
>> Scholars from developed countries will be given priority. Generally
>> considered developed countries have more abundant scientific research
>> resources, experience and article yield that opens up possibilities
>> for higher scientific research. So scholars from developed countries
>> will be given priority. You can let these authors
> know their paper will be published free of charge when you send the
> invitation.
>>

>> In addition, I suggest to divide the free paper quota to discount so that more authors can share the discount, such as:
>>
>> 5, free = 10, 50% = 20, 25%
>>
>> It's may help to attract more papers. Thank you for your consideration.
>>
>> Please don't hesitate to contact me if any questions.
>>
>> I'm looking forward to hearing from you.
>>
>> Kind regards,
>> ████████
>>
>> Section Managing Editor
>> IJERPH (http://www.mdpi.com/journal/ijerph/)
> ████████████████████████████████████
██████████████████████████████████████
>> Guest Editor Recruitment, if you are interested, please send your proposal to ████████ mdpi.com.
>> https://www.mdpi.com/journalproposal/sendproposalsspecialissue/ijerph
>>
>> On 2020/3/6 19:14, Dani Barrington wrote:
>>> Hi ████████
>>>
>>> In an earlier email you mentioned:
>>>
>>> "Guest Editor has a privilege to publish 1 paper free of charge in this special issue and invite 4 feature papers published free of charge."
>>>
>>> I'm just wondering how that works - do I invite specific academics to submit and tell them from the beginning that their paper (if accepted) will be published free of charge? Or do I wait until there are papers ready to be accepted and decide whether we can waive the fees?
>>>
>>> I am particularly thinking about authors from low- and middle-income countries who would add value to this Special Issue, but may not submit unless they know the fee will be waived.
>>>
>>> I think I understand the rest of the process and will start sharing news of the Special Issue with the sector!
>>>
>>> Cheers,
>>> Dani
>>>
>>>
>>> Dr Dani Barrington, FHEA
>>> Lecturer in Water, Sanitation and Health
>>>
>>> Deputy Lead; Water, Public Health and Environmental Engineering
>>> Research Group Programme Lead; Master of Science in Water,
>>> Sanitation and Health Engineering
>>>
>>>
>>> -----Original Message-----
>>> From: ████████ MDPI [mailto:████████mdpi.com]
>>> Sent: 06 March 2020 09:18
>>> To: Dani Barrington <D.J.Barrington@leeds.ac.uk>
>>> Cc: Rebecca Clare Sindall <████████████ Esther Shaylor
>>> <████████████ IJERPH Editorial Office <ijerph@mdpi.com>
>>> Subject: Re: [IJERPH] Special Issue "Learning from Failure: in
>>> Environmental and Public Health Research" Website Is Ready
>>>
>>> Dear Dani, Becky and Esther,
>>>

>>> Thank you very much for your kind understanding. We believe that although the theme is related to failure, the special issue will succeed.
>>>
>>> Please don't hesitate to contact me if any questions.
>>>
>>> Have a nice day and keep in touch.
>>>
>>> Kind regards,
>>> █████
>>>
>>> Section Managing Editor
>>> ████████████████████████████
████████████████████████████
>>> Guest Editor Recruitment, if you are interested, please send your proposal to ██████████mdpi.com.
>>> https://www.mdpi.com/journalproposal/sendproposalsspecialissue/ijerph
>>>
>>> On 2020/3/6 17:09, Dani Barrington wrote:
>>>> Thanks █████ this process sounds fine.
>>>>
>>>> That's a shame about Becky and Esther, but we have decided between
>>>> the three of us that the SI should go ahead as it is a positive
>>>> step in our mission to get failures out there.
>>>>
>>>> Cheers,
>>>> Dani
>>>>
>>>> Get Outlook for Android <https://aka.ms/ghei36>
>>>>
>>>> --
>>>> --
>>>> -
>>>> --
>>>> *From:* █████ ████ MDPI <███████████mdpi.com>
>>>> *Sent:* Friday, March 6, 2020 8:56:29 AM
>>>> *To:* Dani Barrington <D.J.Barrington@leeds.ac.uk>
>>>> *Cc:* Rebecca Clare Sindall <████████████ Esther Shaylor
>>>> <████████████ IJERPH Editorial Office <ijerph@mdpi.com>
>>>> *Subject:* Re: [IJERPH] Special Issue "Learning from Failure: in
>>>> Environmental and Public Health Research" Website Is Ready Dear
>>>> Dani,
>>>>
>>>> Thank you very much for your e-mail.
>>>>
>>>> First, when your SI received the new submission, we will send it to
>>>> your for precheck (if topic is fit for the SI and the quality of
>>>> the paper is worth to process), you can decide whether continue to
>>>> process the manuscript or reject it.
>>>>
>>>> If the manuscript passed precheck, the editor office will find
>>>> reviewers for it (if you have suitable reviewers, please recommend
>>>> to us). After we received enough review reports (at least two valid
>>>> reports), and there have divide opinion report, we will turn to you
>>>> for first decision (you can decide continue or reject), if no
>>>> divide opinion report, we will send the reports to authors for
>>>> revision directly (but if you need check the report, we will also send to you for first decision).
>>>>
>>>> If the above procedures have passed, we will send to authors for
>>>> revision. After the authors resubmitted their manuscript, we will
>>>> send to reviewers for second round evaluation, if no additional
>>>> comments or still have major concerns, we will send to you for

>>>> final decision, then, you can decide accept, reject or revision. Hope I made it clear.
>>>>
>>>> In addition, I'm sorry to let you know that the co-editors were not
>>>> approved by academic editors. We hope Dr Rebecca Sindall and Dr.
>>>> Esther Shaylor can contribute to this Special Issue and we hope we
>>>> can find another chance to collaborate with them in the near future.
>>>> Thank you very much for your understanding.
>>>>
>>>> Please don't hesitate to contact me if any questions and suggestions.
>>>>
>>>> We are looking forward to hearing from you.
>>>>
>>>> Kind regards,
>>>> ███████
>>>>
>>>> Section Managing Editor
>>>> IJERPH (http://www.mdpi.com/journal/ijerph/)
>>>> ████████████████████████████████
████████████████████████████████████
>>>> Guest Editor Recruitment, if you are interested, please send your
>>>> proposal to ███████████ mdpi.com.
>>>> https://www.mdpi.com/journalproposal/sendproposalspecialissue/ijerp
>>>> h
>>>>
>>>> On 2020/3/6 16:25, Dani Barrington wrote:
>>>>> Hi ████████
>>>>>
>>>>> Thanks for this exciting news. I'm a little bit confused though,
>>>>> can you please explain to me the review process - your email below
>>>>> suggests that I (and any other guest editors) just need to "desk
>>>>> accept" the paper, and then MDPI editors will send it for peer
>>>>> review, etc - is that correct? Do the referee comments then come
>>>> back to us to make a decision on? Just getting my head around the
>>>> review system.
>>>>>
>>>>> Also, how do we go about adding extra guest editors to the website?
>>>>> Dr Rebecca Sindall will definitely be a Guest Editor with me, and
>>>>> possibly Esther Shaylor as well (████████████████
██)
>>>>>
>>>>> I am away for the next 3 weeks, so we will probably wait to "announce" the call for papers until then,
but will start letting interested colleagues know.
>>>>>
>>>>> Cheers,
>>>>> Dani
>>>>>
>>>>> Dr Dani Barrington, FHEA
>>>>> Lecturer in Water, Sanitation and Health
>>>>>
>>>>> Deputy Lead; Water, Public Health and Environmental Engineering
>>>>> Research Group Programme Lead; Master of Science in Water,
>>>>> Sanitation and Health Engineering
>>>>>
>>>>>
>>>>> -----Original Message-----
>>>>> From: ████████ @mdpi.com ████████████████████ On Behalf Of
>>>>> system@mdpi.com
>>>>> Sent: 06 March 2020 04:18
>>>>> To: Dani Barrington <D.J.Barrington@leeds.ac.uk>
>>>>> Subject: [IJERPH] Special Issue "Learning from Failure: in
>>>>> Environmental and Public Health Research" Website Is Ready

>>>>>
>>>>> Dear Dr. Barrington,
>>>>>
>>>>> We are pleased to inform you that the website of your Special Issue "Learning from Failure: in Environmental and Public Health Research" has been set up.
>>>>> Please click the following link to check if all the information is correct:
>>>>>
>>>>> https://www.mdpi.com/journal/ijerph/special_issues/Failure_Environ
>>>>> _H
>>>>> e
>>>>> alth
>>>>>
>>>>> The online system has a function for you as an academic editor.
>>>>> Your account is d.j.barrington@leeds.ac.uk The Preliminary
>>>>> Password is ██████
>>>>>
>>>>> You may log in to the online system at https://susy mdpi.com to
>>>>> check the status of all submissions in your
>>>> Special Issue at any time. You can also check all the new
>>>> submissions and do a pre-check to inform the editorial office
>>>> whether they are suitable to process further and be sent for peer-review.
>>>>>
>>>>> For security reasons, you should then ████████████████ ██████████████████████████
>>>>>
>>>>>
>>>>> Kind regards,
>>>>> ████████ ████
>>>>> Assistant Editor
>>>>>
>>>